## FRAMEWORK 33

APPENDIX I
Draft Final Rule

The draft final rule is submitted under separate cover.

FRAMEWORK 33 APPENDIX II

Summary of
1999 Updated Assessments of 11 Groundfish Stocks

# New England Fishery Management Council <br> 5 Broadway, Saugus, MA 01906-1036 <br> Tel (781) 231-0422 • Fax (617) 565-8937 

Chairman
Executive Director
Joseph M. Brancaleone
Paul J. Howard

## MEMORANDUM

Date: August 9, 1999

| TO: | Council members |
| :--- | :--- |
| FROM: | Paul Howard |
| SUBJECT: | Updated Assessment Summary |

The table on the following page provides a summary of the information contained in the "Assessment of 11 Northeast Groundfish Stocks through 1999". The following summarizes the status of the biomass relative to the SFA biomass targets:

At B $\quad$ msv
Control Rule Rebuilding Schedule (Yrs.)

- witch flounder

Above 1/2 B msy $^{\text {B }}$

- Georges Bank yellowtail flounder 10
- Cape Cod yellowtail flounder 10
- American plaice 10
- Southern New England winter flounder 10

At or above $1 / 4 \mathbf{B}_{\text {msy }}$

- Georges Bank cod
- Georges Bank haddock (below min. threshold)
- Gulf of Maine cod
- Georges Bank winter flounder
- white hake (at $1 / 4 \mathrm{~B}_{\text {msy }}$ )

Rebuilt10

Below 1/4 B msv

- Southern New England yellowtail flounder5

Unspecified
555 5

The SFA control rules specify rebuilding periods for stocks below the biomass target. Under these rules, the following actions should be considered by the Council with respect to setting fishing mortality targets in Amendment 13. For some stocks, favorable conditions could allow greater latitude in setting fishing mortality targets in 2000.

Fishing mortality can remain constant or may be increased

- Georges Bank yellowtail flounder
- Southern New England winter flounder
- witch flounder

Fishing mortality should be reduced (\%) but may be above zero (based on status quo F or catch from 1998 to 1999)

- Georges Bank cod (32\%)
- Cape Cod yellowtail flounder (90\%)
- Gulf of Maine cod (50\%)
- American plaice (94\%)


## Fishing mortality should be reduced to zero

- Georges Bank haddock
- Southern New England yellowtail flounder
- Georges Bank winter flounder
- white hake

In addressing these management standards in Amendment 13 or in developing upcoming framework adjustments, the Council will have to consider the difficult problem of how to manage stocks in very different conditions (relative to the SFA objectives) that are caught simultaneously or occupy the same areas. Applying the control rules according to Amendment 9 will achieve the rebuilding objectives of SFA. In some cases, stock status may allow a higher level of fishing than the control rule prescribes.

The Updated Assessment Report contains several cautionary statements about the information in the report, including:

- for many stocks, there is uncertainty in the assessment of current stock status due to variability in estimation of landings at age (resulting from inadequate port sampling)
- assumptions about the stock-recruitment relationships in the projections are imprecise and may bias the results; estimated rebuilding times are highly dependent on recruitment assumptions
- density-dependent changes in weight-at-age and maturation rates are not included in the projections; smaller weights-at-age and slower maturation rates associated with stocks at high biomass sizes implies that rebuilding projections may be optimistic

| STOCK | BIOMASS <br> STATUS <br> $\mathrm{B}_{99} / \mathrm{B}_{\text {MSY }}$ <br> (Biomass <br> target, metric tons) | FISHING MORTALITY |  | PERCENT <br> CHANGE <br> TO <br> ACHIEVE <br> TARGET F | YEARS TOBIOMASSREBUILDINGUNDERTARGET F(50\%probability) | COMMENTS |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | TARGET (F on biomass) | 1999 ESTIMATE (status quo F or catch from 1998) |  |  |  |
| GB cod | $\begin{array}{r} 41 \% \\ (108,000) \end{array}$ | 0.13 | 0.19 | -32\% | 7 | - F in 1998 lowest in times series (since 1978) <br> - SSB increased every year since 1995 |
| GB Haddock | $\begin{array}{r} 43 \% \\ (105,000 \text { SSB }) \end{array}$ | 0.00 | 0.15 (fully recruited F) | -100\% | 3 | - SSB increased 4 times since 1993 <br> - 1998 year class appears to be biggest since 1979 and $3^{\text {rd }}$ largest since 1964 |
| GB yellowtail flounder | $\begin{array}{r} 93 \% \\ (46,850) \end{array}$ | 0.27 | 0.08 | +260\% | 3 | - F since 1996 lowest observed (since 1973) and declining <br> - 1997 year class largest since 1973 <br> - 1998 biomass highest since 1973 |
| SNE yellowtail flounder | $\begin{array}{r} 11 \% \\ (62,870) \end{array}$ | 0.00 | 0.09 | -100\% | 8 | $\begin{array}{ll}\text { - } & \text { F since } 1997 \text { lowest in time series (since } 1973 \text { ) } \\ \text { - } & \text { Biomass increased } 10 \text { times 1994-1998 but still below } 1 / 4 \\ \text { B }_{\text {msy }}\end{array}$ |
| CC yellowtail flounder | $\begin{array}{r} 58 \% \\ (6,100) \\ \hline \end{array}$ | 0.04 | 0.41 | -90\% | 2 | - $\quad$ F in 1998 lowest in time series (since 1985) <br> - Biomass doubled since 1992 |
| GOM cod | $\begin{array}{r} 38 \% \\ (33,000) \end{array}$ | 0.15 | 0.30 | -50\% | 8 | - Fin 1998 lowest since 1982 <br> - Biomass continued to decline to record low level in 1998 due to record low recruits and survival of pre-recruits, but is expected to stabilize and could increase with reduced catches in 1999 |
| witch flounder | $\begin{array}{r} 103 \% \\ (25,000) \\ \hline \end{array}$ | 0.09 | 0.09 | 0\% | Rebuilt | - Biomass highest since 1984, increased 3 fold since 1994 <br> - Every year class entering the fishery since 1995 has been larger than any during 1982-1995 <br> - 1997 year class is largest in time series |
| American plaice | $\begin{array}{r} 60 \% \\ (24,200 \text { SSB }) \end{array}$ | 0.02 | $\begin{array}{r} 0.32 \\ \text { (fully recruited } \mathrm{F} \text { ) } \end{array}$ | -94\% | 4 | - F has declined from record high level in 1995 to record (since 1981) low in 1998 and 1999 <br> - Biomass has stabilized due to several years of poor recruitment <br> - 1997 year class may be one of the 6 largest observed since 1980 |
| GB winter flounder | $\begin{array}{r} 38 \% \\ (11,400) \end{array}$ | 0.00 | 0.42 (fully recruited F) | -100\% | 5 | - F has been reduced by $60 \%$ since 1993 <br> - SSB almost doubled 1994-1996 but has declined slightly due to below average recruitment <br> - 1996 year class is lowest on record |
| SNE winter flounder | $\begin{array}{r} 92 \% \\ (27,800) \end{array}$ | 0.24 | 0.20 | +20\% | 2 | - F declined from near-record levels in 1990 to record low level in 1994 and has remained low since <br> - Biomass has nearly tripled since 1994 |
| white hake | $\begin{array}{r} 25 \% \\ (22,000) \\ \hline \end{array}$ | 0.00 | 0.40 | -100\% | 5 | - F remains high <br> - Biomass remains near record-low |

Biomass of 11 Multispecies stocks
1989-1999


## Projected Biomass of 11 Multispecies Stocks 1999-2009

- Constant SFA Control Rule Target F Applied Year 2000-2009
- 50\% Probability Projection Results
- Haddock Projection Model 1



## FRAMEWORK 33

APPENDIX III
Multispecies Monitoring Committee Report
November, 1999

Copies of the 1999 MSMC Report have been widely distributed and are not included here. Copies are available from the Council office on request, and it may be downloaded in full from the Council website: www.nefmc.org

FRAMEWORK 33
APPENDIX IV

## Recreational Fishery Background Information

## Background Information on Recreational Multispecies Fisheries

Council staff and the Groundfish Plan Development Team (PDT) reviewed recreational fishing data from both the Marine Recreational Fisheries Statistics Survey (MRFSS) and recreational multispecies party/charter logbooks (VTR). Estimates of recreational catch by weight are less reliable than the estimates of catch by numbers of fish for several reasons:

- MRFSS intercept observations of individual species are relatively low, resulting in larger proportional standard errors (PSEs) and confidence intervals.
- MRFSS data is recorded in numbers of fish and then converted into weights based on the average reported weight of fish per two-month wave; this adds another layer of uncertainty to the MRFSS weight estimates.
- VTR data is also reported in numbers of fish and converted to weight estimates based on the MRFSS average reported weight of fish per two-month wave; this adds another layer of uncertainty to the VTR weight estimates.
- The recreational size limit for cod increased from 19" to 21 " between 1995 and 1997. Trends in the recreational fishery could be mischaracterized, especially if landed weight increases even though numbers of fish caught are decreasing.
Therefore, trends in recreational fisheries should be evaluated on the basis of numbers of fish rather than weight of fish.


## Recreational Landings of Multispecies

Table 1 reports total recreational landings, in thousands of fish, estimated from the Marine Recreational Fisheries Statistics Survey from 1990-1998. These landings reflect all modes of recreational fishing, including shore-based fishing, party/charter trips, and private rental trips. According to Table 1, recreational groundfish landings have declined since 1990, despite some fluctuations within certain species and an increase in recreational pollock landings. 1998 landings of Atlantic cod were about $23 \%$ of the 1990 landings. Total red hake recreational landings in 1998 were $6.1 \%$ of the 1990 level. Recreational catch and landings of Atlantic cod are examined in more detail in the following tables.

| SPECIES | $\mathbf{1 9 9 0}$ | $\mathbf{1 9 9 1}$ | $\mathbf{1 9 9 2}$ | $\mathbf{1 9 9 3}$ | $\mathbf{1 9 9 4}$ | $\mathbf{1 9 9 5}$ | $\mathbf{1 9 9 6}$ | $\mathbf{1 9 9 7}$ | $\mathbf{1 9 9 8}$ |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Atlantic Cod | 249.9 | 394.4 | 220.3 | 370 | 281.8 | 469.4 | 167.6 | 165.4 | 57.9 |
| Pollock | 37.8 | 45.1 | 30.2 | 84.8 | 265.1 | 165.3 | 142.4 | 74 | 72 |
| Red Hake | 659.9 | 489.6 | 103.6 | 34.2 | 208.9 | 93.8 | 31.8 | 53 | 40.2 |
| Winter <br> Flounder | $2,143.8$ | $1,637.6$ | 584 | 1,543 | 974.7 | 835.8 | $1,259.7$ | 797.1 | 467.4 |
| Other Cods <br> and Hakes | 47.1 | 130.4 | 25.9 | 30 | 38.2 | 161.2 | 13 | 21.6 | 32.5 |
| Other | 62.9 | 160.4 | 34.5 | 33.1 | 13.6 | 8 | 26 | 41 | 16.4 |
| Flounders |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Table 1 Recreational Multispecies Landings, 1990-1998, in Thousands of Fish
"Other Cods and Hakes" includes, but is not limited to, silver hake, haddock, white hake, spotted hake, southern hake, and cusk.
"Other Flounders" includes, but is not limited to, windowpane flounder, witch flounder, yellowtail flounder, summer flounder, and American plaice.

## Party/Charter Catch of Multispecies

Table 2, A-F, reports landings (in numbers of fish), discards (in numbers of fish), and numbers of anglers for recreational trips catching groundfish according to Multispecies Party/Charter Vessel Trip Reports (VTRs, logbooks). The data are presented for individual groundfish species, including cod, winter flounder, haddock, pollock, redfish, and white hake. Recreational catches of other groundfish species (American plaice and windowpane flounder, for example) are very small and are not presented in Table 2, A-F. It is also important to note that 1994 is considered an incomplete year in terms of logbook reporting and should not be used when evaluating trends in recreational catches as reported in logbooks.

| A-COD |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Fishing Year | Species | No. Discarded | No. Kept | Total No. Anglers |
| 1994* | COD | 80,020 | 99,611 | 37,869 |
| 1995 | COD | 161,069 | 277,779 | 91,295 |
| 1996 | COD | 129,559 | 295,659 | 95,374 |
| 1997 | COD | 113,545 | 217,914 | 87,015 |
| 1998 | COD | 97,547 | 167,343 | 72,749 |
| B - WINTER FLOUNDER |  |  |  |  |
| Fishing Year | Species | No. Discarded | No. Kept | Total No. Anglers |
| 1994* | Winter Flounder | 579 | 5,959 | 4,658 |
| 1995 | Winter Flounder | 6,539 | 15,488 | 12,724 |
| 1996 | Winter Flounder | 3,837 | 18,200 | 9,641 |
| 1997 | Winter Flounder | 5,345 | 37,053 | 11,498 |
| 1998 | Winter Flounder | 2,522 | 9,879 | 6,645 |
| C-HADDOCK |  |  |  |  |
| Fishing Year | Species | No. Discarded | No. Kept | Total No. Anglers |
| 1994* | Haddock | 1,124 | 2,893 | 9,756 |
| 1995 | Haddock | 8,572 | 20,629 | 32,812 |
| 1996 | Haddock | 5,345 | 11,240 | 25,675 |
| 1997 | Haddock | 12,170 | 26,460 | 28,965 |
| 1998 | Haddock | 12,469 | 28,522 | 27,495 |
| D - POLLOCK |  |  |  |  |
| Fishing Year | Species | No. Discarded | No. Kept | Total No. Anglers |
| 1994* | Pollock | 36,920 | 19,999 | 21,366 |
| 1995 | Pollock | 32,731 | 37,015 | 39,854 |
| 1996 | Pollock | 24,233 | 37,601 | 39,861 |
| 1997 | Pollock | 36,431 | 32,127 | 44,516 |
| 1998 | Pollock | 31,222 | 29,686 | 34,276 |
| E-REDFISH |  |  |  |  |
| Fishing Year | Species | No. Discarded | No. Kept | Total No. Anglers |
| 1994* | Redfish | 1,966 | 3,556 | 9,507 |
| 1995 | Redfish | 2,010 | 6,665 | 13,487 |
| 1996 | Redfish | 1,929 | 3,598 | 10,795 |
| 1997 | Redfish | 3,140 | 3,863 | 12,954 |
| 1998 | Redfish | 102,362 | 3,395 | 12,041 |
| F - WHITE HAKE |  |  |  |  |
| Fishing Year | Species | No. Discarded | No. Kept | Total No. Anglers |
| 1994* | White Hake | 242 | 1,899 | 2,602 |
| 1995 | White Hake | 84 | 3,739 | 2,973 |
| 1996 | White Hake | 266 | 2,388 | 3,730 |
| 1997 | White Hake | 354 | 2,471 | 3,035 |
| 1998 | White Hake | 306 | 885 | 2,811 |

Table 2 A-F: Party/Charter Catch in Numbers of Fish and Total Number of Recreational Party/Charter Anglers on Trips Catching the Species (from VTR Data)

## Atlantic Cod and Gulf of Maine Cod Recreational Harvest

Tables 3, 4, and 5 examine trends in the recreational harvest of both Atlantic cod and Gulf of Maine cod in greater detail. Table 3 illustrates trends in MRFSS Type A harvest (landings only),

MRFSS Type A + B1 harvest (landings plus unidentifiable fish, including some component of discards), MRFSS Private Rental A + B1 harvest, and VTR information for multispecies party/charter vessels. All four datasets in Table 3 exhibit similar downward trends. Table 4 compares MRFSS A + B1 catch estimated for Gulf of Maine cod with party/charter VTR catch estimated for Gulf of Maine cod. Again, both datasets exhibit downward trends, although declines in the MRFSS estimates are more pronounced than those in the VTR database. Table 5 illustrates the downward trends in the number of trips and the number of anglers catching Gulf of Maine cod.

Tables 6 and 7 present comparisons of recreational and commercial reductions in catch and/or landings. Both tables compare recent catches and landings to a baseline level. Comparisons of commercial landings with MRFSS data (Table 6) shows that the estimates of A + B1 catch have decreased in proportions similar to the commercial landings. Type A catch estimates (recreational landings) have decreased more than commercial landings, by as much as $82 \%$ from the 1991-1993 baseline. According to Table 7, party/charter VTR reductions since 1995 have also been consistent with reductions in commercial landings since 1995.

## Conclusion

The data from MRFSS and the VTRs do not support the perception that effort from the recreational sector of the fishery has not decreased since the implementation of Amendment 7. The Groundfish PDT reviewed the data and concluded that both the commercial and recreational landings data exhibit a downward trend over time, reflecting the decrease in Gulf of Maine cod stock size and the effect of management measures. Generally, commercial landings have declined more gradually than recreational landings. The time series for the Party/Charter VTR data (1995partial 1999) is not long enough to estimate the magnitude of the reduction that has occurred in that sector of the fishery. However, in terms of numbers of (cod) fish, recreational reductions in landings appear to be relatively consistent with commercial reductions in landings to date.

## ATLANTIC COD (GULF OF MAINE AND GEORGES BANK)

## TABLE 3: RECREATIONAL HARVEST (THOUSANDS OF FISH)

|  | 1995 | $\mathbf{1 9 9 6}$ | $\mathbf{1 9 9 7}$ | $\mathbf{1 9 9 8}$ | $\mathbf{1 9 9 9}$ through 8/99 |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| MRFSS Type A | 469 | 168 | 165 | 58 | N/A |
| MRFSS Type A + B1 | 1,022 | 500 | 474 | 467 | 254 |
| MRFSS Private Rental A + B1 | 329 | 175 | 81 | 140 | 67 |
| Party/Charter VTR | 278 | 296 | 218 | 167 | N/A |

**Type A refers to Observed Harvest (Landings)
${ }^{* *}$ Type B1 refers to fish that are used for bait, released dead, or filleted -
they are killed, but identified by individual anglers and not the interviewer.


## GULF OF MAINE COD

TABLE 4: RECREATIONAL HARVEST (THOUSANDS OF FISH)

|  | 1995 | $\mathbf{1 9 9 6}$ | $\mathbf{1 9 9 7}$ | $\mathbf{1 9 9 8}$ | $\mathbf{1 9 9 9}$ through 8/99 |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| MRFSS A + B1 (from SAW) | 517 | 351 | 161 | 219 | N/A |
| Party/Charter VTR | 171 | 170 | 123 | 110 | 99 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| TABLE 5: PARTY/CHARTER VTR DATA |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Number of Trips | 1995 | 1996 | 1997 | $\mathbf{1 9 9 8}$ | 1999 through 8/99 |
| Number of Anglers | 2,697 | 2,919 | 2,628 | 2,330 | 1,776 |
|  | 69,966 | 62,329 | 45,461 | 52,915 | 38,800 |

**Type A refers to Observed Harvest (Landings)
**Type B1 refers to fish that are used for bait, released dead, or filleted they are killed, but identified by individual anglers and not the interviewer.


## ATLANTIC COD (GULF OF MAINE AND GEORGES BANK)

TABLE 6: Comparison of Recreational and Commercial Reductions from 1991-1993 Baseline

|  | MRFSS A | MRFSS <br> A + B1 <br> Year <br> (thousands) | Commercial <br> Landings <br> (MT) | MRFSS A <br> Reduction <br> from Base | MRFSS A + B1 <br> Reduction <br> from Base | Commercial <br> Reduction <br> from Base |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
|  | 328.2 |  | $\mathbf{3 1 , 0 1 5}$ |  |  |  |
| 1994 | 281.8 | 818.9 | 17,790 | $-14.10 \%$ | $-35.4 \%$ | $-42.6 \%$ |
| 1995 | 469.4 | $1,022.0$ | 13,658 | up 43\% | $-19.4 \%$ | $-56.0 \%$ |
| 1996 | 167.6 | 500.0 | 14,267 | $-48.9 \%$ | $-60.6 \%$ | $-54.0 \%$ |
| 1997 | 165.4 | 473.6 | 13,030 | $-49.6 \%$ | $-62.7 \%$ | $-58.0 \%$ |
| 1998 | 57.9 | 465.7 | 11,119 | $-82.4 \%$ | $-63.3 \%$ | $-64.1 \%$ |

## *1991-1993 Three-Year Average

**Commercial Landings Reported by the National Marine Fisheries Service website
***Type A refers to Observed Harvest (Landings)
****Type B1 refers to fish that are used for bait, released dead, or filleted -
they are killed, but identified by individual anglers and not the interviewer.

## GULF OF MAINE COD

TABLE 7: Comparison Commercial and Party/Charter (P/C) Reductions

| Year (thousands)* |  | MRFSS Reduction from 1995 | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{P} / \mathrm{C} \\ \text { Landings } \\ \text { (thousands)** } \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} \text { P/C } \\ \text { Reduction } \\ \text { From } 1995 \\ \hline \end{array}$ | Commercial Landings (MT)*** | Commercial Reduction From 1995 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1995 | 517 |  | 170.8 |  | 6,798 |  |
| 1996 | 351 | -32.1\% | 169.6 | -0.7\% | 7,194 | up 5.8\% |
| 1997 | 161 | -68.9\% | 123.2 | -27.9\% | 5,421 | -20.3\% |
| 1998 | 219 | -57.6\% | 110.2 | -35.5\% | 4,156 | -38.9\% |

[^0]
[^0]:    *MRFSS Catch estimated by Stock Assessment Working Group
    **Party/Charter Landings from VTR "kept fish" category
    ***Commercial Landings reported by Northern Demersal Working Group, July 1999

